## Fall 2019 Calculus Progression Study

## Introduction

This report includes two studies that intend to answer the following questions:

1. How do students place in corequisite Pre-Calculus with Support and at what placement level?
2. What does progression through the Calculus sequence looks like for first-time corequisite Pre-Calculus students?
a. How does it compare depending on students' placement scores?
3. What does progression through the Calculus sequence looks like for all fall 2019 first-time Pre-Calculus students?
a. How does it compare depending on instruction method (corequisite, regular/traditional, and online/traditional)?

## Study 1

The purpose of study 1 is twofold:

1. Examine fall 2019 corequisite students' placement into Pre-Calculus with Support
2. Examine fall 2019 corequisite students' progression through the Calculus sequence (MATH075/175 $\rightarrow$ MATH190 $\rightarrow$ MATH191)
a. Compare the progression of two groups of students:
i. Students who received a placement score that only gives them the option to enroll in Pre-Calculus with Support (score of 2035 or lower) versus
ii. Students who received a placement score that gives them the option to enroll in either regular Pre-Calculus or PreCalculus with Support (score of 2040 or higher)
Note: This study only includes students who took the Pre-Calculus with Support course (MATH075/175). Students who enrolled in regular Pre-Calculus (MATH175) sections were not included.

Table 1: Fall 2019 corequisite Pre-Calculus with Support students

| Fall 2019 Course | Last Prior Course | Count | Category |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :--- |
| MATH075/175 | none | 164 | Directly Placed into MATH075/175 |
| MATH075/175 | Basic-skills course | 9 | Directly Placed into MATH075/175 |
| MATH075/175 | College-level course | 23 | Directly Placed into MATH075/175 |
| MATH075/175 | Transfer-level (excluding MATH175) | 57 | Progressed from previous course |
| MATH075/175 | MATH175 | $\mathbf{7}$ | Progressed from previous course |
| Total |  | $\mathbf{2 6 0}$ |  |

To summarize the categorizations:

1. If a student took a transfer-level course prior to fall 2019, they are categorized as "progressed from previous course".
2. If a student's last prior course is a basic skills or college-level course, they are categorized as "directly placed into MATH075/175" since they did not actually progress through the sequence to get to MATH075/175.
3. If a student has no prior course, they are categorized as "directly placed into MATH075/175".

Table 2 below shows the placement scores of the 164 students with no prior math course. The majority of students (60\%) received a score of 2025 which is considered the "open to all" placement score. Ninety-two percent of students with no prior math course at Citrus College received a score of 2035 or lower. In the old math sequence prior to AB705 legislation, these students would not have been eligible to enroll in PreCalculus. However, with the implementation of corequisite transfer-level courses with support, these students had the opportunity to enroll in a transfer-level course as their first math course at Citrus College.
There were 7 students who received a 2040 score which is the regular Pre-Calculus (MATH175) placement score. And there were 6 students who received a 2050 score which is the Calculus I (MATH190) placement score. With a score of 2040 or higher these 13 students had to option enrolled in regular Pre-Calculus but chose to enroll in corequisite Pre-Calculus with Support.

Table 2: Placement score of students with no prior math course

| Placement Score | Count | Percent |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| 2025 (entry-level placement; eligible for MATH075/175) | 98 | $60 \%$ |
| 2030 (eligible for MATH075/175) | 18 | $11 \%$ |
| 2033 (eligible for MATH075/175) | 12 | $7 \%$ |
| 2035 (eligible for MATH075/175) | 23 | $14 \%$ |
| 2040 (eligible for MATH075/175 or MATH175) | 7 | $4 \%$ |
| 2050 (eligible for MATH075/175 or MATH175) | 6 | $4 \%$ |
| Total | $\mathbf{1 6 4}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0 \%}$ |

Table 3: Fall 2019 Calculus Progression of Students Grouped by Placement Score

| Placement Score | Corequisite Pre-Calculus (MATH075/175) |  |  |  | Calculus I <br> (MATH190) |  |  |  | Calculus II (MATH191) |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Cohort Enrollment Count | Enrollment Percent | Course <br> Success <br> Count | Success Percent | Cohort Enrollment Count | Enrollment Percent | Course <br> Success <br> Count | Success Percent | Cohort Enrollment Count | Enrollment Percent | Course <br> Success <br> Count | Success Percent |
| placed at 2035 or lower | 151 | 92\% | 72 | 48\% | 62 | 86\% | 43 | 69\% | 29 | 67\% | 17 | 59\% |
| placed at 2040 or higher | 13 | 8\% | 10 | 77\% | 7 | 70\% | 6 | 86\% | 6 | 100\% | 5 | 83\% |
| Total | 164 | 100\% | 82 | 50\% | 69 | 84\% | 49 | 71\% | 35 | 71\% | 22 | 63\% |

## Persistence Rates:

Placed 2035 or lower

- 41\% (62/151) of the MATH075/175 cohort placed 2035 or lower persisted to MATH190
- $\mathbf{1 9 \%}(29 / 151)$ of the MATH075/175 cohort placed 2035 or lower persisted to MATH191

Placed 2040 or higher

- $\mathbf{5 4 \%}(7 / 13)$ of the MATH075/175 cohort placed 2040 or higher persisted to MATH190
- $\mathbf{4 6 \%}(6 / 13)$ of the MATH075/175 cohort placed 2040 or higher persisted to MATH191

Total

- 42\% (69/164) of the total MATH075/175 cohort persisted to MATH190
- $\mathbf{2 1 \%}(35 / 164)$ of the total MATH075/175 cohort persisted to MATH191

The data in Table 3 includes students' who took Pre-Calculus with Support for the first time and compares the Calculus progression of students' who placed at 2035 or lower versus those who placed at 2040 or higher. A placement score of 2035 or lower would place students in the corequisite Pre-Calculus course (MATH075/175). A placement score of 2040 or higher would allow students to take the regular MATH175 course. However, the 13 students in this cohort decided to take the corequisite Pre-Calculus with Support course.

## An explanation of the numbers in Table 3:

1. MATH075/175 Cohort Enrollment and Percentage - This represents the 164 students that directly placed in corequisite Pre-Calculus (MATH075/175). This is the "starting cohort".
2. MATH075/175 Course Success Count and Percentage - This is the count and percent of students enrolled in MATH075/175 who successfully completed the course.
3. MATH190 Cohort Enrollment and Percentage - This shows the count and percentage of successful MATH075/175 students that enrolled in MATH190. For example, $86 \%(62 / 72)$ of students that placed at 2035 or lower successfully passed corequisite Pre-Calculus (MATH075/175) and progressed through the sequence, enrolling in MATH190.
4. MATH190 Course Success Count and Percentage - This is the count and percent of students enrolled in MATH190 who successfully completed the course.
5. MATH191 Cohort Enrollment and Percentage - This shows the count and percentage of successful MATH075/175 students that enrolled in MATH191. For example, $67 \%(29 / 43)$ of students that placed at 2035 or lower successfully passed Calculus I (MATH190) and progressed through the sequence, enrolling in Calculus II (MATH191).
6. MATH191 Course Success Count and Percentage - This is the count and percent of students enrolled in Calculus II (MATH191) who successfully completed the course.

## Below are some observations:

- Students placed at 2035 or lower had lower success rates in all three calculus courses compared to students placed at 2040 or higher.
- Students who placed at 2035 or lower and successfully passed Pre-Calculus progressed to Calculus I at a higher rate ( $86 \%, 62 / 72$ ) than students placed at 2040 or higher (70\%, 7/10). However, students who placed at 2035 or lower and successfully passed Calculus I progressed to Calculus II at a lower rate $(67 \%, 29 / 43)$ than students placed at 2040 or higher $(100 \%, 6 / 6)$.
- When examining the Calculus progression of both starting cohorts, students who placed at 2040 or higher persisted through the calculus sequence (i.e. from $075 / 175 \rightarrow 190 \rightarrow 191$ ) at higher rate $(46 \%, 6 / 13)$ than students placed at 2035 or lower $(19 \%, 29 / 151)$.
- It is important to note that the two groups have uneven sample sizes. Only $8 \%$ of the cohort $(13 / 151)$ placed at 2040 or higher.

The data in Table 4 is comparing students' success through the Calculus sequence based on their placement score.

Table 4: Fall 2019 Calculus Progression of Students by Placement Score

| Placement Score | Corequisite Pre-Calculus <br> (MATH075/175) |  |  |  | Calculus I <br> (MATH190) |  |  |  | Calculus II (MATH191) |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Cohort Enrollment Count | Enrollment Percent | Course <br> Success Count | Success Percent | Cohort Enrollment Count | Enrollment Percent | Course <br> Success <br> Count | Success Percent | Cohort Enrollment Count | Enrollment Percent | Course <br> Success <br> Count | Success <br> Percent |
| 2025 | 98 | 60\% | 43 | 44\% | 36 | 84\% | 24 | 67\% | 16 | 67\% | 11 | 69\% |
| 2030 | 18 | 11\% | 11 | 61\% | 9 | 82\% | 7 | 78\% | 4 | 57\% | 3 | 75\% |
| 2033 | 12 | 7\% | 4 | 33\% | 4 | 100\% | 3 | 75\% | 2 | 67\% | 1 | 50\% |
| 2035 | 23 | 14\% | 14 | 61\% | 13 | 93\% | 9 | 69\% | 7 | 78\% | 2 | 29\% |
| 2040 | 7 | 4\% | 6 | 86\% | 4 | 67\% | 4 | 100\% | 4 | 100\% | 3 | 75\% |
| 2050 | 6 | 4\% | 4 | 67\% | 3 | 75\% | 2 | 67\% | 2 | 100\% | 2 | 100\% |
| Total | 164 | 100\% | 82 | 50\% | 69 | 84\% | 49 | 71\% | 35 | 71\% | 22 | 63\% |

Office of Institutional Research, Planning and Effectiveness

## Study 2

For study 1 only corequisite students' progress was examined. In a follow-up study the scope was expanded to include all first-time Pre-Calculus students in fall 2019. Therefore, for the study 2 the purpose was to:

1. Examine first-time Pre-Calculus students' progression through the Calculus sequence (MATH075/175 or MATH175 $\rightarrow$ MATH190 $\rightarrow$ MATH191)
a. Note: This study only includes first-time Pre-Calculus takers in fall 2019. In other words, students included have not taken any prior math course at Citrus College.
2. Compare students' progression by Pre-Calculus instruction method. In fall 2019 there were three Pre-Calculus instruction methods:
a. Corequisite instruction (7 sections)
b. Traditional instruction of regular Pre-Calculus without corequisite support (4 sections)
c. Online instruction of regular Pre-Calculus without corequisite support (3 sections)

Table 5: Fall 2019 Pre-Calculus students

| Instruction Method | No Prior Math | Has Prior Math | Total |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Corequisite Math | $164(63 \%)$ | $96(37 \%)$ | $260(100 \%)$ |
| Traditional Regular Math | $27(28 \%)$ | $68(72 \%)$ | $95(100 \%)$ |
| Online Regular Math | $29(26 \%)$ | $81(74 \%)$ | $110(100 \%)$ |
| Total | $\mathbf{2 2 0}(\mathbf{4 7 \% )}$ | $\mathbf{2 4 5}(53 \%)$ | $\mathbf{4 6 5}(100 \%)$ |

Table 5 displays the total fall 2019 Pre-Calculus (MATH075/175 or MATH175) enrollment disaggregated by instruction method. Out of the total 465 students enrolled, a little less than half (47\%) were first-time MATH175 takers. When comparing by instruction method the majority of students in corequisite sections (63\%) are enrolled in Pre-Calculus for the first time. In contrast, for students enrolled in regular Pre-Calculus without corequisite support, only $26 \%$ of students in online sections and $28 \%$ of students in traditional sections are first-time Pre-Calculus takers.

The large percentage of first-time Pre-Calculus takers in corequisite sections may speak to the original intention of AB705 which provides access to transfer-level coursework in mathematics to all students with the purpose of maximizing completion within a one-year timeframe.

The following data only includes students in the highlighted column in Table 5. These are students who have not taken any prior math course.

Table 6: Fall 2019 Calculus Progression of Students* by Instruction Method

| Pre-Calculus Instruction Method | Pre-Calculus (MATH175) |  |  |  | Calculus I <br> (MATH190) |  |  |  | Calculus II (MATH191) |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Cohort Enrollment Count | Enrollment Percent | Course Success Count | Success Percent | Cohort Enrollment Count | Enrollment Percent | Course <br> Success <br> Count | Success Percent | Cohort Enrollment Count | Enrollment Percent | Course <br> Success <br> Count | Success Percent |
| Corequisite Instruction | 164 | 75\% | 82 | 50\% | 69 | 84\% | 49 | 71\% | 35 | 71\% | 22 | 63\% |
| Regular/Traditional Instruction | 27 | 12\% | 11 | 41\% | 10 | 91\% | 8 | 80\% | 6 | 75\% | 6 | 100\% |
| Regular/Online Instruction | 29 | 13\% | 18 | 62\% | 6 | 33\% | 5 | 83\% | 3 | 60\% | 3 | 100\% |
| Total | 220 | 100\% | 111 | 50\% | 85 | 77\% | 62 | 73\% | 44 | 71\% | 31 | 70\% |

*Note: Only students with no prior Citrus College math course enrollment were included. In other words, the data in this table examines first-time Pre-Calculus takers.

## Persistence Rates:

Corequisite Instruction

- 42\% (69/164) of the MATH075/175 cohort placed 2035 or lower persisted to MATH190
- $\mathbf{2 1 \%}(35 / 164)$ of the MATH075/175 cohort placed 2035 or lower persisted to MATH191

Regular/Traditional Instruction

- 37\% (10/27) of the MATH075/175 cohort placed 2040 or higher persisted to MATH190
- $\mathbf{2 2 \%}(6 / 27)$ of the MATH075/175 cohort placed 2040 or higher persisted to MATH191

Regular/Online Instruction

- $21 \%(6 / 29)$ of the total MATH075/175 cohort persisted to MATH190
- $\mathbf{1 0 \%}(3 / 29)$ of the total MATH075/175 cohort persisted to MATH191

The data in Table 6 is comparing the Calculus progression of first-time Pre-Calculus by course instruction method.

## An explanation of the numbers in Table 6:

1. MATH175 Cohort Enrollment and Percentage - This is the 220 students who enrolled in Pre-Calculus (MATH175) in fall 2019 and have no prior math enrollment at Citrus College. This is the "starting cohort".
2. MATH175 Course Success Count and Percentage - This is the count and percent of students enrolled in MATH175 who successfully completed the course.
3. MATH190 Cohort Enrollment and Percentage - This shows the count and percentage of successful MATH075/175 students that enrolled in MATH190. For example, $84 \%(69 / 82)$ of students that successfully passed corequisite Pre-Calculus (MATH075/175) progressed through the sequence and enrolled in MATH190.
4. MATH190 Course Success Count and Percentage - This is the count and percentage of MATH190 takers who successfully completed the course.
5. MATH191 Cohort Enrollment and Percentage - This shows the count and percentage of successful MATH075/175 students that enrolled in MATH191. For example, $71 \%(35 / 49)$ of students that successfully passed corequisite Pre-Calculus (MATH075/175) continued through the Calculus sequence and enrolled in MATH191.
6. MATH191 Course Success Count and Percentage - This is the count and percentage of MATH191 takers who successfully completed the course.

## Below are some observations:

- Students enrolled in online instruction of regular Pre-Calculus had the highest success rates in all three calculus courses.
- Students enrolled in traditional instruction and who successfully passed Pre-Calculus progressed to Calculus I at the highest rate (91\%, $10 / 11$ ). Similarly, students enrolled in traditional instruction and who successfully passed Calculus I progressed to Calculus II at the highest rate ( $75 \%$, 6/8).
- When examining the Calculus progression of all three starting cohorts, students enrolled in traditional instruction persisted through the calculus sequence (i.e. from $075 / 175$ or $175 \rightarrow 190 \rightarrow 191$ ) at the highest rate $(22 \%, 6 / 27)$. Corequisite students had a similar persistence rate $(21 \%, 35 / 164)$ through the Calculus sequence.

